

## Annex 10: Palestine's WTO Accession and Administrative Reform

**Preferred Outcome:** successful and sustainable administrative reform in the Palestinian Authority's institutions that lays the foundation for Palestine's WTO accession.

Stakeholders	Interests	Options	BATNA	Objective Criteria
Palestinian Authority	<p>The PNA is interested in reaching a political settlement with Israel; therefore, abiding by the principles of good governance is a necessary condition for the success of peace process.</p> <p>The PNA is interested in putting in place a democratic system based on international principles.</p> <p>The PNA is interested in strengthening the Palestinian public institutions in order to improve the quality and the quantity of services delivery to citizens.</p>	<p>Status Quo</p> <p>Carry out reforms gradually and simultaneously with the progress in the peace process.</p> <p>Gain assistance from the international community to set in motion administrative reforms and other complementary reforms.</p> <p>Conduct administrative reforms that secure the national interests and at the same time ensure the principles of good governance.</p> <p>Carry out consultation and coordination on policy formulation with the private sector.</p>	<p>Status Quo- Focusing on all fronts at the same time with minimum (or no) achievements.</p> <p>Focusing on the political front while ignoring other fronts.</p> <p>Starting up with feasible reforms like fiscal reforms.</p> <p>Conduct superficial reforms to give the impression that reforms are underway and get the support of donor community.</p>	<p>WTO agreements and laws.</p> <p>Washington Consensus (IMF &amp; WB) criteria.</p> <p>Public opinion survey</p> <p>UNESCO reports on the economic situation.</p> <p>UNCTAD reports on improving the administrative system in the PNA institutions.</p> <p>WB reports on the public expenditures in the PNA institutions.</p>

	<p>The PNA is interested in boosting its international image and conducting reforms would give it more credibility internally and externally.</p> <p>The present Palestinian leadership is interested in using the reform mantra as a way to improve the chances for the presidential and legislative candidates.</p> <p>The PLC members are interested in receiving appointments during the next administration.</p> <p>Economic Development</p> <p>Employment</p> <p>Health &amp; Education</p>	<p>Conduct consultation with the donor community, IMF&amp; the WB representatives to involve them in the reform process and get their approval to offer financial and technical support.</p> <p>Prepare media strategy to mobilize the public's consent.</p> <p>Conduct public information campaign to inform citizens and get their feedback.</p> <p>Hold private and public meetings with public service representatives to come up with solutions to improve service quality, work performance and to ease the tension that might result from downsizing the number of public servants or deploy them to the private and NGOs sector.</p> <p>Carry out a campaign to curb corruption and malfeasance at all levels of the Palestinian institutions.</p>		<p>UNDP –good governance principles.</p> <p>Strengthening the PNA institutions- CFR report.</p>
<b>tion</b>	Economic Development	Conduct administrative reforms that secure the national interests	Status Quo	History

<p>Employment</p> <p>Health &amp; Education</p>	<p>and at the same time the principles of good governance.</p> <p>Status Quo</p> <p>Oppose reform initiatives</p> <p>Support the reform</p>	<p>Oppose reforms</p>	<p>Islamic religion principles for the Islamic groups and Marxists values for the secular groups.</p>
<p>Ensure that reform would secure an enabling market for investment and the development of the private sector.</p> <p>Increase the private sector's profits as market opening and WTO membership would do so.</p> <p>Pave the way to attract more investment and joint-venture projects.</p> <p>Promote growth and development.</p> <p>Bolster the private sector image in international markets.</p>	<p>Status Quo</p> <p>Refrain from investing in Palestine.</p> <p>Introduce new laws such as the competition law.</p> <p>Lobby for the passage of administrative reform and other trade reforms.</p> <p>Make their support to the leadership contingent upon the passage of certain laws and regulations.</p> <p>Build alliance with private sector organizations in the Arab and western world in order to learn and share experiences and to</p>	<p>Status Quo</p> <p>Invest in other predictable and transparent markets.</p> <p>Refrain from investing in Palestine.</p> <p>Exert pressure on the Palestinian leadership to pass relevant laws and regulations.</p> <p>Sign a voluntary agreement among private companies to stamp out corrupt actions or mismanagements in their companies to improve the image of the private sector internationally.</p>	<p>International trade agreements</p> <p>Reports on the economic and commercial benefits that reforms have achieved in other countries.</p> <p>Transparency International Reports.</p> <p>International indexes that rate countries according to investment atmosphere.</p> <p>IMF and WB report.</p>

---

		<p>explore potential markets.</p> <p>Lobby for the law amendments such as the telecommunication law.</p> <p>Hold private and public dialogues with cabinet and PLC members to set out the Palestinian priorities regarding trade and relevant reforms.</p> <p>Build coalitions with the PLC and NGO representatives to have a bearing on the cabinet to press ahead with reforms.</p> <p>Working with the public sector institutions on formulating national policies and strategies.</p>		
--	--	---	--	--

	<p>NGOs have a large stake in improving the access to justice, promoting social and economic goals and Judicial and legal reform and reform initiatives will help them in playing a more crucial role on these fronts.</p> <p>Reforms would give the NGOs the task of working as watchdog agencies.</p> <p>Improving the service quality.</p> <p>Gain more international financial and technical support and being part of reform will ensure the continuous flow of funds.</p>	<p>Status Quo: the Palestinian NGOs are playing a crucial role in this regard by helping the PA in setting priorities and forming development strategies.</p> <p>Lobby for the passage of new NGO law.</p> <p>Work with the private sector to lobby cabinet and PLC members to pass certain laws and regulations.</p> <p>Build coalition with international and regional NGOs with similar situations to learn and share experiences.</p> <p>Conduct media and public relation campaign to introduce the public to the benefits of reforms and the changes that they will bring about.</p>	<p>Taking the lead in the reform initiatives by placing more pressure on the PNA.</p> <p>Building alliances with civil society organizations to exert influence on their governments to help the PNA in its efforts at reform.</p> <p>Boycott the PNA in the case that these reforms did not come through.</p>	<p>International trade agreements.</p> <p>UN Good Governance principles.</p> <p>Human Rights agreements</p> <p>International anti-corruption agreements such as that with the OECD</p>
<b>ational unity</b>	<p>They demonstrated their sustained commitment to strengthen the Palestinian institutions to help in building a democratic, transparent and</p>	<p>Status Quo</p> <p>Conditionality of connecting any more funding with progress on administrative reform and other reforms in the Palestinian</p>	<p>Status Quo</p> <p>Refrain from offering more funds to reform projects.</p> <p>Refrain from offering</p>	<p>International trade agreements- WTO.</p> <p>anti- corruption agreements</p>

	<p>accountable state.</p> <p>To prove to the European parliament and to the US Congress that the financial assistance to the Palestinian people are used for reform purposes.</p> <p>Promote peace and stability in the Middle east and modern democracies in the Arab World would secure this interest.</p> <p>Profits and market share</p>	<p>institutions.</p> <p>Building alliances with private sectors and civil society organizations to exert influence on the Palestinian leadership to press ahead with reforms.</p> <p>Offering training to the promising Palestinian professionals in reform topics.</p>	<p>direct assistance to the Palestinian leadership and Palestinian institutions.</p>	<p>IMF and the WB papers</p> <p>UN- good governance principles</p> <p>Human rights laws</p> <p>The Oslo agreement-understandings</p> <p>Monterrey/Mexico aid conference understandings</p>
<p>employees</p>	<p>Protecting their jobs in the Palestinian institutions.</p> <p>Efficient service delivery to citizens.</p> <p>Career development</p> <p>Credible recruitment system built on merits-- not personal connection</p> <p>Equal access to job opportunities.</p>	<p>Status Quo</p> <p>Oppose reform</p> <p>Improve their daily work and service delivery</p> <p>Enroll in training programs to enhance their performance</p> <p>Try to negotiate the reform agenda and influence it to their advantage</p>	<p>Search for a job in the private sector or in civil society organizations.</p> <p>Work in Israel</p> <p>Oppose the reform by stopping service delivery</p>	<p>White papers and advocacy letters</p> <p>Media and public campaign.</p> <p>Inter-ministerial meetings proceedings</p>

<b>Palstinian Actuals</b>	<p>Boost Palestine's international image and credibility.</p> <p>Build a democratic and viable state.</p> <p>Abiding by the good governance principles.</p> <p>Economic Development</p> <p>Employment</p> <p>Security &amp; peace</p> <p>Education &amp; health conditions Improvement</p>	<p>Status Quo</p> <p>Employ pressure on the PNA to conduct and implement reforms.</p> <p>Launch public campaign to introduce people to the reforms' benefits and to seek their support for meaningful reforms.</p> <p>Put together coalitions of PLC and civil society representatives to monitor the reform process.</p> <p>Build alliances with Arab World intellectuals to push their governments to proceed with reforms at the same pace.</p>	<p>Status Quo</p> <p>Write articles and Op-Ed pieces in the national and international newsletters and newspapers to exert pressure on the PNA to conduct profound reform.</p> <p>Mobilize and rally citizens to express their dissatisfaction with the current service delivery system.</p> <p>Hold public meeting to discuss the reform issue.</p>	<p>International agreements</p> <p>UN Charters</p> <p>UNDP &amp; UNCTAD reports about the performance of the Palestinian institutions.</p> <p>CFR report</p>
<b>Palstinian Aspirations</b>	<p>Efficient access to service delivery.</p> <p>Reduce the cost and time of getting into the government's departments and institutions.</p> <p>Credible and trust- worthy system of governance.</p>	<p>Status Quo</p> <p>Support the reform</p> <p>Participate in the reform consultation process.</p> <p>Stand against the reform.</p> <p>Support or oppose reform</p>	<p>Express their indifference towards the reform</p> <p>Sign public petition seeking reforms.</p> <p>Write Op-Ed pieces</p>	<p>Public opinion- polls</p> <p>Phone calls and letters</p> <p>Rights to vote?</p>

	Equal access to services.	through letters and phone calls. What about voting?		
	Maintain security  Achieve economic prosperity  Activate the trade arrangements with European and Arab countries.	Status Quo  Support the PNA efforts at reform.  Thwart the PNA efforts at reform.	Status Quo  Support the PNA efforts at reform.  Thwart the PNA efforts at reform.	International and regional agreements.  WTO rules.
	WTO is interested in increasing the number of countries bound by the global trading regime.  Stability and economic growth in the Middle East.	Status Quo	Status Quo	International agreements and WTO rules and obligations.
<b>nd WB</b>	Stability and economic growth in the Middle East	Status Quo  Empoly funds-conditionality approach.  Granting their credit of approval to grant funds or approve debts.	Status Quo  Exert political pressure to conduct reforms.	Washington-consensus criteria.



<b>AD</b>	<p>Help developing countries in coping with the new rules of the global trading system.</p> <p>Prepare developing and particularly Arab countries to meet the WTO requirements.</p> <p>Stability and economic growth in the Middle East</p>	<p>Status Quo</p> <p>Hold workshops to raise awareness.</p> <p>Coordinate activities with the WTO –Middle East secretariat.</p> <p>Coordinate activities with the Arab League and progressive Arab institutions.</p> <p>Publish reports and studies about the need for reforms and the nature and implications of such reforms in the Arab World.</p>	<p>Status Quo</p> <p>Build coalitions with certain Arab Countries to proceed with the reform process.</p> <p>Conditionality by making technical assistance contingent upon reform advancement.</p>	<p>UN relevant reports and resolutions.</p> <p>UN relevant conventions findings and meetings' proceeding.</p>
-----------	---	---	--	---

## **Bibliography**

Agnes, Padilla. "An enabling government: civil service commission", Asian review of public administration, Vol. VIII, NO 1. July-December 1996.

AMIR program. "Public Policy Advocacy Strategy (CIPE)", Jordan, October 1999.

AMIR Program. "Trade and Investment information system in Jordan", Jordan, June 2001.

Bahour, Sam. "Palestinian private sector information technology policy study", Paltrade. Palestine 2001.

Benamrane, Djilani. "Globalization and Good Governance", October 29, 1998. Available at: [www.multimania.com/djilalibenamrane/uk/GLOBALIZATION.html](http://www.multimania.com/djilalibenamrane/uk/GLOBALIZATION.html). (Accessed on 11/14/2001)

Chandarasorn, Voradej, "Public sector reform: a hypothetical model of successful reform adoption and implementation", Asian Review of Public Administration, Vol. VIX, No1, January-June 1997

Cheena, Shabbir. "Equity within diversity: state reform and renewed citizenship in Asia", Paper presented at the International Seminar on Society and State Reform (Sao Paulo, Brazil, 26/29 March.

Corruption status in Palestine and public perception. Available at: <http://www.pcpsr.org/survey/cprspolls/97/poll28a.html#corrupt>. (Accessed on 11/20/2002).

Costin, Claudia. "Administrative Reform in Brazil", Available at: [www.frbatlanta.org/econ\\_rd/larg/fiscal\\_policy/public\\_sector/reform.htm](http://www.frbatlanta.org/econ_rd/larg/fiscal_policy/public_sector/reform.htm). (Accessed on 11/11/2001).

Darwish, Mehdi, "Accountability in Some Government Executive Agencies", Asian Review of Public Administration, Vol. X, Nos1-2, January-December 1998.

Dhungel, Dwarika, "Organizational Restructuring for Administrative Reform: the Nepalese Experience", Asian Review of Public Administration, Vol. VIII, No. 1, July-December 1996.

Dollar, Davis & Svensson, Jakob, "What explains the success or failure of structural adjustment programs?" macroeconomic and Growth Group, The World Bank, April 1998.

Drabek, Zdenek & Payne, Warren. "The impact of transparency on foreign direct investment", Economic research and analysis division, WTO, August 1999.

---

Hall, David, and Steve Davis. "Corruption and whistle blower- a background note for TUAC", Public services international research unit, London 1999. Available at: [www.psir.org/reportsindex.htm](http://www.psir.org/reportsindex.htm))

IFC. "Private sector assessment in low-income countries: A participatory approach to diagnosis and implementation," Washington, D.C.1996.

IPCRI. "Guidelines for the final status economic negotiation: The goals of final status economic agreement", Jerusalem, 1998.

IMF. "Recent experiences, prospects and challenges to private sector development", 1998.

Khoury, Riad. "The welfare state, Globalization, and Middle East peace: the case of Jordan". Available at: [www.mevic.org/papers/welfare-state.html](http://www.mevic.org/papers/welfare-state.html). (Accessed on 11/12/2001)

Lapidoth, Ruth. "Autonomy: flexible solution to ethnic conflicts", United States Institute of Peace Press, Washington DC, 1997.

Lynn, Laurence. "Globalization and administrative Reform: What is happening in theory?" Paper presented to the fourth international research symposium on Public Management (IRSPM IV) (Erasmus University, Rotterdam, The Netherlands, 10-11 April, 2000).

MOPIC's 2000 third quarterly monitoring report on donor's assistance.

Nash, John, Wendy Takacs. "Trade policy reform: lessons and implications", World Bank, 1998.

National trade dialogue project. Summary. Available at: [www.partrade.org/paltrade/ntc...](http://www.partrade.org/paltrade/ntc...) (Accessed on 4/5/2002).

OECD. "Regulatory Reforms", Available at: [www.ciaonet.org/pbei/occd/oec03.html](http://www.ciaonet.org/pbei/occd/oec03.html). (Accessed on 11/13/2001)

OECD. "Improving the quality of laws and regulations: economic, legal and managerial techniques", Paris 1994.

OECD. "The OECD reports on regulatory reform. Paper of the Ministerial Council", May 1997.

Oszlak, Oscar, "Building capacities for governance in Argentina," Asian Review of Public Administration, Vol. XII, No1, January-June 2000.

Palestinian Center for Human Rights. "Palestinian Legislative Council: performance evaluation in the first two terms (March 1996 – March 1997)", series study (13), November 1998.

Palestinian budget deficit, available at [www.arabia.com](http://www.arabia.com) (Accessed on April 6, 2001)

---

Palestine's position papers (drafts) for the preparation of the WTO Membership and observership.

Palestinian Center for Policy and Survey Research (PSR): Palestinian draft constitution Prepared By The Constitution Committee. The DRAFT Of the Palestinian Constitution. In Cooperation with the Konrad Adenauer Foundation 2000.

Palestine's trade agreements, available at: [www.Paltrade.com](http://www.Paltrade.com). (Accessed on 28/10/2001).

Palestinian Economic Policy Research Institute. "Palestinian-Israeli trade relations (2): trade policy options for the WBS", issue No 2. MAS: Jerusalem 1996

Palestinian Ministry of Trade & Economy. Economic Relations between Israel and The Palestinian Authority: background paper. August 1998.

PECDAR. Palestine Building the foundation for economic growth. Available at: [www.pecdar.org/economicre...building-foundation/CHAPTER4.html](http://www.pecdar.org/economicre...building-foundation/CHAPTER4.html). (Accessed on 1/26/01)

PNA. "Overview of the Palestinian Economic Policy and Foreign Trade Regime", The Ministry of Economy and Trade. 2000

PNA. The West Bank and Gaza Economic Policy Framework Progress Report. Prepared by the PA in collaboration with the IMF. May 31, 2000. And submitted the Secretariat of the Ad Ho Liaison Committee.

Razeen, Sally. "National trade policy reforms, the WTO and the millennium round: the case of developing countries and countries in transition", Paper presented for the Cato Institute's Center for trade policy studies conference, "Seattle and beyond: the future of the WTO," November 17, 1999, Washington, D.C.

Report of the priority issues task force: National Academy of Public Administration (NAPA). January 10, 2000.

Rodrik, Dani. "The development countries hazardous: obsession with global integration", Foreign Policy Magazine, March /April 2001.

Samuels, Michael. "Public policy advocacy strategy: Final report", AMIR project: Access to Micro finance and improved implementation of policy reform, Amman: Jordan, October 1999.

Sayigh, Yazid & Shikaki, Khalil. "Strengthening Palestinian Public institutions", Council on Foreign Relations, New York, 1996.

Schwartz, Hermann. "Defamation and Democracy", the Packer School Journal of East European Law, 1996

Sharma, S.D. "Moralizing civil society: NGO initiatives to fight corruption and promoting good governance in the Indian context." Paper presented in the Workshop on promoting integrity (Manila, Philippines: Governance in the World Conference on Governance, 31 May-4 June 1999).

Shuaibi. Azmi. “ Elements of corruption in the Middle East and North Africa: the Palestinian case”, the 9<sup>th</sup> international anti-corruption Conference, Cairo, September 1999.

The Washington Institute. “UN Resolution 242: Building Block of Peacemaking.” Washington, DC, 1998.

The UN office of the special coordinator in the Occupied Territories. “Rule of law development in the WBG: survey and state of the development effort”, May 1999.

USAID. Economic support Fund: West Bank and Gaza. Available at: [www.usaid.gov/pubs/cp2000/ane/wbnk\\_ga.html](http://www.usaid.gov/pubs/cp2000/ane/wbnk_ga.html). (Accessed on 10/26/2001)

UN. Security Council Resolution 242 (1967) of 22 November 1967. Adopted unanimously at the 1382<sup>nd</sup> meeting.

UN general assembly resolution 49/49 of 9 Dec 1994, Part a, paragraph 2 and 4.

UN. Security Council Resolution 383 (1973) of 22 October 1973. Adopted at the 1747<sup>th</sup> meeting by 14 votes to none.

UN. United Nation Resolutions Regarding Palestine. Available at: [www.pna.net/search/TitleDetails.asp?txtDocID=44](http://www.pna.net/search/TitleDetails.asp?txtDocID=44) (Accessed on 10/10/01)

UNDP. Support to the governance and public administration reform (phase II). Available at: [www.surfsouthasis.org/NEW/SURF/GOV/UNDP/PROJ/LAO/97?GovPubRef2S.shtm](http://www.surfsouthasis.org/NEW/SURF/GOV/UNDP/PROJ/LAO/97?GovPubRef2S.shtm). (Accessed on 11/14/2001)

UNDP. UNDP policy on Governance: Globalization and liberalization. Available at: <http://magnet.undp.org/news/may97.htm>. (Accessed on 11/12/2001)

UNDP. UNDP: public administration program. Available at: [www.medeia.be/en/index018.htm](http://www.medeia.be/en/index018.htm). (Accessed on 11/11/2001).

UNDP. “Globalization and liberalization: effects of international economic relations on poverty: interagency thematic contribution to the international year for the eradication of poverty”, New York and Geneva. 1996. (UNCTAD/ECDE/PA/4/Rev. 1

UNDP conference on new frontiers for strengthening administrative integrity, transparency and accountability, Cairo, September 19-22, 1999.

UNCTAD. “A framework for developing Palestinian trade in services and elaborating policy guidelines-issue notes”, Geneva 2001.

UNCTAD. “The Palestinian economy and prospects for regional cooperation”, June 30, 1998.

UNCTAD. “World Investment report 1998: trends and determinants”, August 1998 & WTO report. “Trade and Foreign Direct Investment”, October 9, 1996.

---

UNCTAD. The Palestinian Economy: Achievements of the interim period and tasks for the future. Geneva 2001.

UNSCO. Report on the Palestinian Economy. Spring 2001.

World Bank. Reforming Public Institutions and strengthening Governance. November 2000.

World Bank. Comprehensive Development framework for public administration. Jerusalem 1999.

World Bank. Public policy for the private sector: viewpoint: Private sector development department Website, October 2001

World Bank. Legal Development Project for the West Bank & Gaza: Project document. July.1997.

World Bank. West Bank & Gaza: Strengthening Public sector Management. August 1999.

World Bank. Administrative & civil service Reform. Available at: [Www1.worldbank.org/publicsector/civilservice/](http://www1.worldbank.org/publicsector/civilservice/). (Accessed on 10/26/01).

World Bank. Legal Institute of the Market Economy. Available at: [Www1.worldbank.org/publicsector/legal/](http://www1.worldbank.org/publicsector/legal/). (Accessed on 10/26/01)

World Bank. World Bank development reports 2002: building Institutions for markets. Available at: [http://econ.worldbank.org/wdr/subpage.php? Pr=2391](http://econ.worldbank.org/wdr/subpage.php?Pr=2391). (Accessed on 10/10/2001)

World Bank. “An information technology strategy for the “ web economy’ in the West Bank and Gaza.” Jerusalem. January 2000.

World Bank. “Reforming public institutions and strengthening governance”, World Bank strategy, November 2000

World Bank. “WBGs economic policy framework progress report”, May 31, 2001.

### **Palestinian Development Plans:**

- The Palestinian Development Plan for 1996.
- The Palestinian Development Plan for 1998-2000.
- The Palestinian Development Plan for 2000-2003.

### **Project Documents:**

- The World Bank- legal development project: project document.
- The World Bank public expenditure review: project document.

---

-The rule of law project document. Available at: [www1.worldbank.org/publicsector/legal/](http://www1.worldbank.org/publicsector/legal/). (Accessed on 2/2/2002).

-PNA. "The Palestinian Public Investment Program (PIIP) for 1997", Project document presented to the Consultative Group meeting on the assistance to the Palestinian people. Paris-France (19-20 November, 1996).

-PNA. Higher National Committee for Institutional Development: position paper. March 1999.

-DFID.PAID Project Document. Department for International Development, UK, 2000.

#### **Newspapers and periodicals:**

-“100 days plan of the Palestinian”, JMCC, June 23, 2002.

- “Top Palestinian tax official arrested by the PA police”, Ha'aretz, July 22, 2002.

-“PA agrees to let US monitor funding”, The Jerusalem Post, July 22,2002.

-“Palestinian leaders asking for a profound reform”, Al-Quds newspaper, July 22, 2002.

-“European commission welcomes Arafat announcement of elections and reforms and signature of law on independence of judiciary”, EU –external relation office, Brussels, May 16,2002.

-“Commission decides on emergency rehabilitation of administrative infrastructure of the PA”, EU-external relation office, Brussels, June 27<sup>th</sup>, 2002.